

Japanese Revisionists and the 'Comfort Women' Issue: a Comparison of Two Texts

Micheal Cooper

愛国の誇りと国民の士気を再生するため、「美しい国、日本」を政権構想に掲げた安部元総理大臣は、2007年3月、第二次世界大戦中の日本軍が、女性を強制的に性労働者として従事させた証拠はないという公式声明を発表した。これを受けて世界のマスメディアと各国政府は激しい憤りを示し、生存する「慰安婦」に対して公式に謝罪するよう強く求めている。本記事では、リベラル系英国新聞「The Independent」と日本の保守系新聞「読売新聞」の記事を批判的談話分析を用いて比較し、筆者のイデオロギーが、事件や問題を描写する言葉において、そして記事が作り出す読者との関係においてどのように明確であるかを明らかにする。

When Japanese Prime Minister Shinzo Abe, the architect of the “Beautiful Japan” campaign to renew Japanese national pride and morale, made a public statement in March 2007 that there was no evidence the Japanese military coerced women into serving as sex workers during World War II, the international media and many governments replied with outrage and demands for a formal apology to the surviving “comfort women”. This article uses Critical Discourse Analysis to compare a story from the liberal British newspaper *The Independent* and an article from the conservative Japanese newspaper *The Yomiuri Shimbun* to reveal how the ideology of a text’s producer is evident in the language used to represent events and subjects and in the relationship the text forms with the reader.

This analysis uses Norman Fairclough’s procedure for Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) to compare two articles about the current Japanese administration’s public statements concerning WWII sex workers: “Japanese Prime Minister angers victims of wartime sex slavery,” from the UK newspaper *The Independent* (Appendix 1, hereafter Text-I), and “Background of ‘Comfort Women’ Issue / Comfort station originated in govt-regulated ‘civilian prostitution,’” from the *Daily Yomiuri*, an English newspaper in Japan (Appendix 2, hereafter Text-Y). This analysis examines some of the ideological issues underlying the controversy by comparing the representation of events and subjects and the relationships each text establishes with the reader.

PM Abe’s comments and the “comfort women” issue

Prime Minister Shinzo Abe and his supporters in the Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) have undertaken a campaign called ‘Beautiful Japan,’ the goal of which is to renew Japanese national pride, confidence, and morale. Abe and his supporters promote, among other policies, a revision of history textbooks to omit references to Japan’s war crimes and a ‘re-thinking’ of the 1993 admission by Yohei Kono of the Imperial Army’s coercion of women and girls into sexual service as ‘comfort women’ during World War II. In March 2007, Abe stated that no evidence was found that women were coerced into sexual service, a claim made frequently by Japanese revisionists like the Society for Dissemination of Historical Fact (Ogata, 2007), the Japanese Society for History Textbook Reform (2007), and the Association for Advancement of Unbiased View of History (2007), who will hereafter be referred

Micheal Cooper is System Administrator at Miyazaki International College. Correspondence may be sent to: MIC, 1405 Kano, Kiyotake-cho, Miyazaki-gun, Japan 889-1605, Tel: 0985-85-5931, Fax: 0985-84-3396, E-mail: mcooper@miyazaki-mic.ac.jp

to as Japanese revisionists. The passage on 26 June 2007 of U.S. House of Representatives Resolution 121 (Honda, 2007), which calls on the Japanese government to admit guilt and apologize, has further angered these groups.

Critical Discourse Analysis

Jaworski and Coupland (2006) and Fairclough (1995) introduce CDA by distinguishing it from other linguistic fields. CDA attempts to show “how social structures determine properties of discourse, and how discourse in turn determines social structures” (Fairclough, 1995, p.27, cited in Jaworski & Coupland, 2006, p.28-9). Fairclough is ultimately concerned with the relationship between language and power in society, and this distinguishes CDA from other forms of discourse analysis.

Each member of a society interprets her world through socially-determined “knowledge of language, representations of the natural and social worlds..., values, beliefs, assumptions, and so on” (Fairclough, 1989, p.24) which Fairclough calls Member’s Resources (MR). Because MR has the status of “a given,” it is unexamined and accepted without question, thus acting as the medium by which discourse and society shape one another: “social structures shape MR, which in turn shape discourses; and discourses sustain or change MR, which in turn sustain or change structures” (Fairclough, 1989, p.163). MR is the link between language and power.

For Fairclough, CDA is not an exercise in scholarship or an abstract investigation; it is a socio-politically transformative act of defiance to the status quo in modern capitalist society: “Discourse analysis offers a means of exposing or deconstructing the social practices that constitute ‘social structure’ and what we might call the conventional meaning structures of social life” (Jaworski & Coupland, 2006, p.5), and by doing so, the CDA practitioner hopes to emancipate those members of society who do not have power: “Critical discourse analysts need to see themselves as politically engaged, working alongside disenfranchised social groups” (Jaworski & Coupland, 2006, p.30). The CDA practitioner does this by revealing how control of power is maintained through control of discourse.

Fairclough’s CDA framework

I have chosen to base my analysis on the three-stage framework that Fairclough lays out in *Language and Power* (Fairclough, 1989). Table 1 summarizes the aspects relevant to this discussion.

Fairclough offers his three-stage CDA framework as a tool to enable the practitioner to reveal how formal features of a text influence and are influenced by social power structures, with the ultimate goal of revealing how the details of language use can actually affect who holds power in a society. This analysis will focus on how the texts compared reveal their discourses and ideologies and how these discourses relate to the institutional and societal context.

The Texts

The two newspaper articles analyzed here – one from the UK and one from Japan – are used to demonstrate how CDA reveals the relationship between language, discourse, ideology, and power. Text-I appeared in *The Independent*, a UK newspaper with a mostly liberal readership. Text-Y appeared in *The Daily Yomiuri*, an English-language Japanese newspaper published by the conservative Yomiuri Shimbun; however, the Japanese version was also published in the Yomiuri

Table 1. Summary of Fairclough's discourse analysis framework

Description of the formal features of the text At the core of CDA is the assertion that the formal features of a text – lexis, grammar, textual structure - ultimately influence and are influenced by larger social structures. The Description dimension of this analysis describes how the formal features of the two texts, when compared on common points of dispute, reveal the ideologies of their creators.	
Vocabulary	What experiential, expressive, and relational values do words have, particularly in reference to subjects? Are there words which are ideologically contested, like euphemistic expressions? Are there instances of the metaphorical transfer of a word or expression from one domain of use to another?
Grammar	What experiential, expressive, and relational values do grammatical features have? Is agency unclear? Are sentences active or passive? What modes (declarative, grammatical question, imperative) are used? How are (simple) sentences linked together?
Textual Structures	What larger-scale structures does the text have?
Interpretation of the relationship between text and interaction Fairclough's Interpretation dimension deals with the relationship between text production and the MR of the text consumer. The writer's assumptions about the reader's knowledge and beliefs define the ideal reader, and the actual reader must negotiate a relationship with this ideal reader in the interpretation of the text. As the Interpretation section of this analysis will show, the relationship between actual and ideal readers affects a text's persuasiveness.	
Context	What interpretations are participants giving to the situational and intertextual contexts, including the relationship between the actual reader and the ideal reader?
Explanation of the relationship between interaction and social context Fairclough's Explanation dimension of CDA reveals the connection between discourse and social structures, including how discourse determines, maintains, and reproduces these structures (Fairclough, 1989, p.163). This paper will briefly address the relationship between the discourses revealed in the two texts and the institutional and societal power struggles of their social contexts.	
Social determinants	What power relations at institutional and societal levels help shape this discourse?
Effects	How is this discourse positioned in relation to struggles at the institutional and societal levels? Is the discourse normative with respect to MR or creative; does it contribute to sustaining or transforming existing power relations?

Shimbun, so the audience includes both Japanese nationals and Japan-resident foreign nationals.

Description of the text: Vocabulary, Grammar, and Textual Structure

Introduction

The two texts under consideration address a sensitive issue in international politics, and since a large part of political struggle occurs "in language and over language" (Fairclough, 1989, p.23), this section will describe how lexis, grammar, and textual structure differ between the two texts in the representation of events and subjects and how these choices are ideologically motivated.

Lexical choice plays a prominent role in this section, because both texts exercise "the power to constrain content...to favor certain interpretations and 'wordings' of events, while excluding others" (Fairclough, 1989, p.51-2). Choice of vocabulary can place a text in an ideology by, among other things, choosing words associated with an ideology, collocating words, and using metaphorical transfer of a word or expression from one domain of use to another (Fairclough, 1989, p.113-4). Fairclough notes that "choice entails exclusion as well as inclusion", and by comparing these two ideologically-opposed texts, we will show that absences also reveal the underlying ideology of a discourse (Fairclough 1989, p.210). Both texts attempt to redefine agents and events to support their respective positions on the issue.

Table 2 compares the number of times ideologically-contested terms are used in the two texts.

Rather than following the questions in the order Fairclough lists them in his framework, this analysis is organized around common themes that arise in the two texts, as Table 3 summarizes.

The "comfort women": sex slaves or prostitutes?

Both texts assert that "comfort women" is an inaccurate euphemism in need of clarification: Text-Y claims they were actually prostitutes; Text-I, sex slaves.

Table 2 illustrates that Text-I uses comfort station or comfort wom[ae]n in 'scare quotes'. Fairclough explains how quotation marks can dissociate the writer from the quoted phrase (Fairclough, 1989, p.90) by putting a term in quotation marks when the text is not directly quoting another speaker or writer: the quotation marks signify that the author does not endorse the term but is just borrowing it to make a point. When referring to the women directly, Text-I avoids the term "comfort women" in favor of "slaves" or "victims." When Text-I uses 'scare quotes' in the passage about the "comfort station" where Gil Won-ok was raped, it highlights the irony of a "comfort" station where there was so much pain. These lexical choices are used in the present tense to signify continuing victimization, in line with Text-I's use of "victim", a term absent from Text-Y.

In contrast, Text-Y uses the terms "comfort wom[ae]n" and "comfort station" many times but includes no stories or quotations from individual comfort women; the exclusive use of these references reduces the women to an abstract collective. Only the ideologically-disputed term "comfort women" is used to refer to them, which at first seems to indicate an endorsement of the current usage. However, Text-Y uses the phrase "so-called" to question the terms' suitability, such as when it refers to "so-called comfort women" who "received remuneration in return for sexual services at so-called comfort stations." Text-Y implies that, if the women received

remuneration, these comfort stations were no more than brothels. The terms "comfort wom[ae]n" and "comfort station" are used without qualification when referring to the dispute itself ("the comfort women issue") and when collocating with lexis that redefines the term as prostitution: "The reasons cited for the need for comfort women and wartime brothels." Other collocations include "remuneration", "recruited", "brothel", and "prostitution".

Table 2. Comparison of frequency of use of ideologically-contested terms.

Term or Reference	Text-I	Text-Y
"comfort wom[ae]n"	3	13
"slave"	3	2
"prostitute" / "prostitution"	1	6
"comfort station"	4	2
"brothel"	1	8
"so-called"	0	2
use of quotation marks around a term to indicate that the author is distancing herself from it	5	0
"sexual service"	0	3
"rape"	6	1
"Imperial"	0	3
"recruit"	0	3
"victim"	2	0
"denial" / "denier" / "deny"	4	0

The bias of the text producer is easily detected in the choice of lexis used to define subjects in the text, but bias can be also be introduced more subtly when judgments and opinions are implicit grammatically as part of subordinate clauses and rhetorically as given information. In its list of reasons for establishing wartime brothels, Text-Y cites the advantages of medically-verified comfort women over "local prostitutes". By foregrounding the distinction between local and military-approved prostitutes, the text backgrounds the implicit assumption that these women were indeed prostitutes. The same thing happens when Text-Y states that "During the war, comfort women were not called 'jugun ianfu' (prostitutes for troops)," that the use of the word "jugun" started after the war ended. By foregrounding the dispute over the term "jugun" ("under military management"), Text-Y backgrounds the equation of "ianfu" with "prostitute," concluding that the comfort stations were "the battleground version of civilian prostitution." This relegation of disputed points to the status of given information is consistent with Text-Y's assertion that the details of the comfort women issue have been resolved and that Text-Y itself is simply a listing of facts.

Table 3. Outline of the differences in the way the two texts define the comfort women and their activities

Description	Text-I	Text-Y
References to the women	Uses quotation marks to distance author from term comfort women; prefers slaves or victims	Uses so-called to distance author from the term; doesn't use victims
References to their work	Prefers slavery	Prefers prostitution or sexual service, which is conducted in brothels
References to relationship between the women and the Japanese military	Uses language from economic and commercial domain	Uses language related to conquest and slavery
References to the Japanese revisionists	Prefers forms of the verb deny	Frames the revision of history as an attempt to correct mistakes and misrepresentations
References to the Japanese military and government	Makes no distinction between past and present Japanese governments	Specifies "Imperial" army and distances WWII-era Japan from the current administration
References to hidden agents	Personified power of memories of the past and suffering continue to pursue the women	Political machinations of foreign governments and liberal domestic newspapers manufacture controversy for their own ends
Textual structures	Dramatic narrative, 3-part matching pattern structure	List-like, telegraphic, like internal memo style with no appeals to sentiment or morality

The work of the comfort women: enslavement or commercial prostitution?

The word "slavery" is used in the title of Text-I, while "prostitution" is used in the title of Text-Y, more or less summarizing the differences in underlying ideology between the two texts. Text-I repeatedly uses slave/slavery in reference to Japan, while Text-Y only uses the word when quoting the US House of Representatives resolution and in reference to German sex camps.

However, lexical choice, especially in the title, is easily noticed and questioned by readers, but the metaphorical transfer of language from one domain of use to another (Fairclough, 1989, p.113-4) is a more subtle way to place discourse in an ideology. Text-Y's use of business terminology to frame the relationship between the comfort women and the military in economic terms is an example of such transfer: Text-Y refers to the "recruited" comfort women as "women who provided sexual services to officers and soldiers." The terms "provided services," like the phrase "brothels catering to soldiers" uses the language of commerce to define the comfort women as prostitutes doing a job. The term "recruit" further

implies that the women entered the comfort stations willingly, as one would apply for a job. In contrast, Text-I refers to women being "forced" into the comfort stations as slaves, and commerce-related terminology is not used.

Text-Y only uses "rape" once, in reference to what comfort stations were trying to prevent, while Text-I repeatedly uses "rape" with the Japanese as the agent. The corresponding term in Text-Y would be "sexual service," which further reinforces the mercantile relationship it claims existed between the comfort women and the Japanese military.

The Japanese revisionists: denial versus correction

While Text-I refers to the revisionists as deniers, a term that the reader will associate with holocaust denial groups, Text-Y, which claims to be setting the record straight by correcting mistaken perceptions, does not use the word "denial" at all: Text-Y begins by asking "Why has such a biased view of the issue prevailed?" and then goes on to frame the its argument as a correction that requires first understanding "the social background of the time when prostitution was authorized and regulated by the government in Japan." Understandably, the revisionists don't refer to themselves as deniers because they assert there is nothing to deny.

The Japanese government: which Japan are we talking about?

Text-Y distances the current Japanese government from the WWII-era Japanese government with the term "Imperial," as in "countries invaded by the Imperial Japanese Army." Text-I on the other hand makes no distinction between current and past Japan, referring to the war as "Japan's rampage across Asia in the 1930s and 40s." The lack of a qualifier equates the Abe administration with WWII Japan. Text-Y, however, never directly refers to Japan's role in WWII; the only reference to the war itself is when Germany's WWII sex camps are mentioned.

Invisible forces at work

Text-Y uses passive constructions to imply that unseen forces are at work. In "Controversy over the so-called comfort women has been inflamed again," Text-Y implies an agent, and then follows this sentence with a reference to US House of Representatives Resolution 121. Though only implied initially, this accusation is made explicit in the third story (Appendix 4) in this series of articles (Appendices 2-4), of which Text-Y is the first. The Yomiuri suggests that Mike Honda, the representative pushing the legislation, is attempting to bolster non-Japanese Asian support in his district by appeasing China and Korea, thereby portraying the issue as being not about truth but about politics in an attempt to discredit the legislation.

Text-I also depicts unseen forces, but it does so in active sentences in which the subject is the personification of something intangible. All the former comfort women are consistently portrayed as victims, manipulated against their will, as when "[A]nger and the call of the past drags Gil Won-ok from her bed in a suburb of Seoul to the Japanese embassy in the South Korean capital." She is not an agent but a victim of these past wrongs that drive her on, even in her campaign against the wrong-doers, thus reinforcing her victim status. The present tense "drags" also emphasizes that the comfort women issue has not been, as PM Abe asserts, concluded.

In "Thousands died in painful silence after a lifetime of torment until a group of Korean victims began to speak out in the early 1990s", Text-I implies a tormentor,

an agent imposing a life of torment. Again, the experience of having been comfort women is represented as a hidden agent that continues to "torment" these women.

In both texts, the protagonist is victimized by an unseen agent: in Text-I, the former comfort women are pursued by the memories of their ordeals; in Text-Y, the Japanese government's problems are created by a US politician trying to secure votes at home.

Time and age

The two texts treat time and age very differently, and these differences follow from the ideology behind each text.

To emphasize the decades these women have waited for recognition, Text-I contrasts the age of these survivors with the age of their abduction. Text-I specifies that some comfort women were "as young as 12," that Guo Xi-cui was "just 15," and that Gil Won-ok was "a teenage girl" when she was "raped daily" by "Japanese soldiers." Text-I refers to the women now as a "frail 78-year-old," a "Seoul pensioner," and an "Adelaide grandmother". The present perfect tense Text-I uses in describing how "For 15 years, the Korean 'comfort women' have stood outside this embassy" leaves the reader with an image of these aging women waiting for retribution, only to receive "another official denial."

In contrast, Text-Y rarely refers to a personal experience of time or age. The women petitioning for apologies from the Japanese are consistently referred to with the age-neutral term "women", and time is only referred to in descriptions of statements made by Japanese officials in passages such as "According to an investigation report publicized by the government on Aug. 4, 1993...."

Text-Y measures time in institutional, political terms, and its assumes that official statements define the truth. In contrast, Text-I measures time in human, personal terms and directly quotes the former comfort women as witnesses of history. This contrast demonstrates the underlying assumptions of both texts: in Text-Y, only official decisions matter and personal testimony is irrelevant; in Text-I, personal experience and memory trump the political mechanizations of governments. The assumptions which underlie both texts are themselves assertions about truth and evidence.

Textual structures: dramatic narrative versus internal memo

Both I and Y are newspaper articles, so their genre, in terms of function and intended audience, is journalism. As such, the authors are following what they consider "professional practices" (Fairclough, 1989, p.54) in journalism by reporting what they see as the truth. However, they have different conceptions of truth and the role of the journalist in society: Text-I is a moving narrative written by the compassionate journalist trying to better the world; Text-Y, a list of clarifications written by a newspaper bringing objective, official truth to light on complex, over-politicized issues.

The first half of Text-I contains a vivid portrayal of three former comfort women told in their own words. The stories are told in a three-part matching relation; Coulthard (1992) examines the use of this pattern in jokes and children's stories to demonstrate how such a matching relationship highlights the contrast of the third element. Coulthard explains how children learn that repetition often accompanies matching and that "the significance of the matching is to be found in the replacement" (Coulthard, 1992, p.35). Text-I presents the women in the following order: Korean, Chinese, and Dutch-Australian. It begins far away from

the reader in Asia, with old women who speak other languages and have different cultures and customs. Of course, one can expect the reader to have sympathy with these Asian women, but putting the "Adelaide grandmother" who was "planning to become a nun" in the contrasting third position brings the issue into the reader's ethnic and cultural group, assuming that the readership of the *Independent* is predominantly British, and the majority of readers will be English-speaking, Caucasian, and Christian. It should be noted that this trio of women does not parallel the ethnic composition ratio of the comfort women, since very few were Dutch. The ordering and the use of matching relations with the Australian in the third position brings the comfort women issue closer to the British reader.

The first half of Text-I exhibits lexical choice more suitable for editorial or creative narrative genre than for journalism: sympathetic lexical descriptors like "frail 78-year-old," "elderly women," "an Adelaide grandmother", and "the Seoul pensioner" refer to the former comfort women in terms that evoke sympathy for and humanize them.

After this fable-like dramatization of these women, the tone of Text-I shifts noticeably when it starts reporting in impersonal political terms the mechanizations of the Japanese government and its supporters, as demonstrated by the lexical choices in the transition sentence, "But the issue has galvanised the Japanese right, who deny government involvement." The contrast between sympathetic, humanizing lexis for the women and the impersonal lexis used for the Japanese government makes the Japanese position seem even colder and less compassionate.

Text-I also uses juxtaposition and sequence to emphasize the brutality of what happened, such as when Jan Ruff-O'Herne is described as "aged 21 and planning to become a nun" when she was "raped by an officer." The fact that she was planning to become a nun not only emphasizes that these women were not professional prostitutes but also increases the sense of violation. Also, notice that the perpetrator was specifically "an officer" and not the hypernym "soldier," implying that this practice was an official part of the Japanese army's conduct and not random sexual violence and further emphasizing the power difference.

The quotations included in Text-I seem to have been chosen to create a strong emotional reaction. The panic of the rape victim is dramatically conveyed when Text-I quotes Guo Xi-cui as saying that "two or three men" held her legs. The reader understands it was so terrible and traumatic that she is unsure of exactly how many men there were.

Text-I's foregrounding of personal testimony and emotional consequences contrasts with Text-Y's impersonal tone, which seems to be more objective and less biased than Text-I because of the absence of metaphor, vivid descriptions, and appeals to reader sentiment. However, the appearance of neutrality is a sign of a naturalized discourse type (Fairclough, 1989, p.92). The surface objectivity of Text-Y is an attempt to portray the perspective expressed therein as the objective truth.

Text-Y's telegraphic style, with its lack of explicit transitions between arguments, reads like an internal memo of policy statements. The sequence of sentences itself implies their mutual relevance, and the absence of appeals to emotion or attempts at justification implies that such appeals are unnecessary. Text-Y presents itself as simply a list of truths meant to clarify a misunderstood issue.

Summary

This section has used Fairclough's description dimension to examine what lexical, grammatical, and textual structure choices were made in the production of the texts and how these choices reveal underlying ideologies. Both articles are

supporting a position rather than reporting objectively on facts, and this is in line with Fairclough's insistence that no text is objective because every producer has an ideology that influences what she believes and how she behaves (1989: *passim*).

CDA stresses the link between textual features and social power structures, and Description reveals how the text and discourse interact, but we must address Interpretation and Explanation to understand the connection to society and power. A full analysis would be out of the scope of this analysis, so we will address only the points most relevant to the texts compared here.

Interpretation

Seducing the ideal reader

The Interpretation stage deals with the interaction between the text and the reader. Fairclough asserts that texts in newspapers are written for an 'ideal reader' with access to knowledge about issues and familiarity with other texts (Fairclough, 1989, p.153). Text-I and Text-Y posit very different ideal subjects or interpreters, but in both cases, these ideal subjects are presented as desirable, encouraging the actual reader to conform to this role and accept the argument offered.

Text-Y presupposes an intelligent Japanese realist who cannot be deceived or manipulated by the propaganda of foreign governments; Text-I addresses an enlightened international realist who will not be deceived by the tactics of a right-wing Japanese minority. Even without explicit appeals, both texts seduce the reader into compliance by portraying him/her as too sophisticated to be easily manipulated. "Media discourse has built into it a subject position for an ideal subject, and actual viewers or listeners or readers have to negotiate a relationship with the ideal subject" (Fairclough, 1989, p.49), and when the ideal subject is flattering, the reader is more likely to comply.

Explanation

Societal power structures that shape the discourse

Both Texts must satisfy their respective readerships in order to maintain market share, so the newspaper must cater to the expectations of its readers. Text-I, in its appeal on behalf of human rights and justice, is "normative" (Fairclough, 1989, p.165) with respect to its liberal reader's MR. The original Japanese version of Text-Y published in the Yomiuri Shimbun, in its defense of Japan against unfair and opportunistic foreign criticisms, is also normative with respect to the conservative reader's MR. However, Text-Y itself, published in the English-language Daily Yomiuri which is read mostly by ex-patriots, is "creative" (Fairclough, 1989, *ibid*) with respect to the reader's MR, because it is challenging the reader's concept of Japanese wartime conduct.

The position of the discourse in relation to societal power struggles

Text-Y participates in power struggles on multiple levels. Locally, Text-Y is part of a struggle between the Yomiuri and its liberal rival, the Asahi Shimbun. Text-Y is the first of a three-part series, and the third article (Appendix 4) states that the comfort women issue is a misunderstanding caused by irresponsible reporting of statements made by PM Miyazawa in the Asahi Shimbun - "known for its leftist leanings" (Ogata, 2007, p.5). The opposing sides in this fight for readers and

political support are the ruling Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) and the Yomiuri Shimbun against opposition political parties and the Asahi Shimbun. Text-Y maintains existing domestic power relations by presenting the views of the current administration as objective fact.

On the international level, this is a struggle for the power to define Japan's WWII conduct. Neo-nationalists in the LDP are want to rewrite constitutional prohibitions against the use of military power, and an official admission of WWII atrocities would make this difficult to justify. Also, many of the revisionists in the ruling LDP are, like Abe, from powerful political families with ties to WWII Japan, so the subject of war crimes is personally relevant for them. Pressures from China, Korea, and now the US are pressuring Japan to make amends to the women who served in comfort stations, and in the process, WWII Japan is being defined by the international community. Text-Y, by voicing the perspective of the Abe administration, aids the government in trying to take control of the issue by defining the terms used, what information is considered relevant, and who may contribute to the discussion.

Summary

Text-Y, which reads like a briefing of official "truth" with no individual agent responsible for the message, projects a less personal and more institutional tone than Text-I, which appeals to sympathy and morals. While Text-I presents the human consequences of the issue, Text-Y treats the very same subject as an unambiguous pseudo-controversy settled long ago.

Fairclough intended CDA to be used as a consciousness-raising exercise for language users - not only second-language learners, but also for native-speaking members of a society in a mediated world. Unlike sentence diagrams, CDA addresses concrete issues of who gets what and lives how in a society. CDA reveals the importance of language in social mobility and struggles for power, and according to Fairclough, the CDA practitioner has a responsibility to use this discipline for the common good.

The power of CDA lies in connecting formal features of specific texts to real-world consequences, and what is at stake in the struggle between Text-I and Text-Y is government compensation for surviving former comfort women, the conscience and prestige of Japan, and Japan's future as a pacifist nation.

References

- Association for Advancement of Unbiased View of History (2007). Retrieved June 20, 2007, from <http://www.jiyuu-shikan.org/e/database3.html>
- Coulthard, M. (1992) On the importance of matching relations in the analysis and translation of literary texts. *Ilha do Desterro*, 27, 33-43.
- The Daily Yomiuri (2007a) Background of 'comfort women' issue / Comfort station originated in govt-regulated 'civilian prostitution' [online]. Retrieved June 6, 2007, from <http://www.yomiuri.co.jp/dy/national/20070331dy01.htm> (reproduced in full at <http://realrobot.iza.ne.jp/blog/entry/143664/>).
- The Daily Yomiuri (2007b) Background of 'comfort women' issue / No hard evidence of coercion in recruitment of comfort women [online]. Retrieved June 6, 2007, from <http://www.yomiuri.co.jp/dy/national/20070331dy02.htm> (reproduced in full at <http://realrobot.iza.ne.jp/blog/entry/143689/>).

- The Daily Yomiuri (2007c) Background of 'comfort women' issue / Kono's statement on 'comfort women' created misunderstanding [online]. Retrieved June 6, 2007, from <http://www.yomiuri.co.jp/dy/national/20070402dy01.htm> (reproduced in full at <http://realrobot.iza.ne.jp/blog/entry/145406/>).
- Fairclough, N. (1989) *Language and Power*. London: Longman.
- Fairclough, N. (1995) *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. London: Longman.
- Honda, M. (2007) H. Res. 121: Expressing the sense of the House of Representatives that the Government of Japan [online]. Retrieved July 8, 2007, from <http://www.govtrack.us/congress/bill.xpd?bill=hr110-121>
- The Society for History Textbook Reform (2007) In Response to the Appearance of "Military Comfort Women" in History Textbooks, "Tsukurukai" is Established [online]. Retrieved July 8, 2007, from http://www.tsukurukai.com/02_about_us/03_move_01.html
- Jaworski, A. & Coupland, N. (2006) *The Discourse Reader*. London: Routledge. pp.1-38.
- Ogata, Y. (2007) The Truth about the Question of the "Comfort Women" [online]. Retrieved July 8, 2007, from http://www.sdh-fact.com/CL02_1/24_S4.pdf

Appendices

Appendix 1: Text-I "Japanese Prime Minister angers victims of wartime sex slavery" (The Independent)

Once a week, anger and the call of the past drags Gil Won-ok from her bed in a suburb of Seoul to the Japanese embassy in the South Korean capital. The frail 78-year-old is haunted by memories of what happened to her as a teenage girl when she was raped daily by Japanese soldiers in a Second World War "comfort station". "I was in so much pain. Sometimes I didn't know if I was going to live or die."

For 15 years, the Korean "comfort women" have stood outside this embassy to demand recognition from the Japanese government. Now, instead of an apology, they have heard another official denial. Japanese Prime Minister Shinzo Abe said last week there was "no evidence" to prove the women were coerced. The statement has enraged the women. "They can't make this go away by lying about it," Gil Won-ok said.

Yesterday Mr Abe said the government stood by a 1993 admission that Japan had forced women into sexual slavery. But he also suggested that it would "reinvestigate" the comfort-women issue, a demand from about 120 politicians on the right of the ruling Liberal Democratic Party (LDP) who demand the admission be reversed.

Elderly women across Asia tell stories similar to the treatment of the Seoul pensioner. In the Chinese province of Shanxi, Guo Xi-cui was just 15 when she held in a comfort station for 40 days. She said Japanese soldiers stood watching as "two or three men" held her legs. "They spread them until I was injured and then they raped me," she said. "When they sent me home I was not able to sit properly."

Jan Ruff-O'Herne, an Adelaide grandmother, and her friends were taken from a Japanese concentration camp in Java to a comfort station. "We were given flower names and they were pinned to our doors," she told Australian television. Then aged 21 and planning to become a nun, Ms O'Herne was raped by an officer.

According to Amnesty International, thousands of women from across Asia - some as young as 12 - were "enslaved against their will and repeatedly raped, tortured and brutalised for months and years" by the Japanese military. Thousands died in painful silence after a lifetime of torment until a group of Korean victims began to speak out in the early 1990s. Ms O'Herne remembers watching the women on television: "I thought, now is my time to speak out."

But the issue has galvanised the Japanese right, who deny government involvement. "The women were legal prostitutes in brothels," Nobukatsu Fujioka, a revisionist academic, said. He is one of the leading figures in a movement that aims to overturn much of the accepted wisdom about what took place during Japan's rampage across Asia in the 1930s and 40s.

Twelve out of 18 members of Japan's cabinet belong to a political forum that wants to "rethink" history education and backs many of Professor Fujioka's views. His Society for History Textbook Reform has sold 800,000 copies of a revisionist history book that denies war crimes such as the comfort women and the Rape of Nanjing. Before coming to power, Mr Abe was one of the society's supporters.

The revisionist denials are refuted by many Japanese historians. "The military decided when, where, and how 'comfort stations' were to be established," Yoshiaki Yoshimi, a professor of history at Tokyo's Chuo University, said.

Former Japanese soldiers have also testified to their involvement in the wartime rape of Asian women. Hajime Kondo, who was stationed in China from 1940-44, recalled kidnapping a woman in Shanxi Province and taking turns with his comrades in raping her. He said the thought that gang rape was wrong "never occurred" to him until he had his own family.

The deniers, however, have grown stronger since a 1993 statement by chief cabinet secretary Yohei Kono that the military was directly involved. That statement has never been accepted by the right. Now, with the prospect of a US Congressional resolution calling on Tokyo to "formally apologise and accept historical responsibility" for the comfort women, a delegation of LDP politicians is to travel to the US to lobby for the resolution to be quashed.

Mr Abe's supporters say his plummeting approval ratings have forced him to go for broke. "If he is true to his beliefs and says what he feels, his popularity will rise," Professor Fujioka said.

Appendix 2: Text-Y "BACKGROUND OF 'COMFORT WOMEN' ISSUE / Comfort station originated in govt-regulated 'civilian prostitution' (The Yomiuri Shimbun)

Controversy over the so-called comfort women has been inflamed again. The U.S. House of Representatives has been deliberating a draft resolution calling for the Japanese government to apologize over the matter by spurning the practice as slavery and human trafficking.

Why has such a biased view of the issue prevailed? The Yomiuri Shimbun carried indepth reports on the issue Tuesday.

The writers are Masanobu Takagi, Hiroaki Matsunaga and Emi Yamada of the political news department. Starting today, The Daily Yomiuri will carry the stories in three installments.

To discuss the comfort women issue, it is indispensable to understand the social background of the time when prostitution was authorized and regulated by the government in Japan.

Prostitution was tacitly permitted in limited areas up until 1957, when the law to prevent prostitution was enforced. Comfort women received remuneration in return for sexual services at so-called comfort stations for military officers and

soldiers. According to an investigation report publicized by the government on Aug. 4, 1993, on the issue of comfort women recruited into sexual service for the Japanese military, there is a record mentioning the establishment of such a brothel in Shanghai around 1932, and additional similar facilities were established in other parts of China occupied by the Imperial Japanese Army.

Some of them were under the direct supervision of the military authorities, but many of the brothels catering to soldiers were privately operated.

Modern historian Ikuhiko Hata, a former professor at Nihon University, says the comfort women system should be defined as the "battleground version of civilian prostitution."

Comfort women were not treated as "paramilitary personnel," unlike *jugun kangofu* (military nurses) and *jugun kisha* (military correspondents).

During the war, comfort women were not called "*jugun ianfu*" (prostitutes for troops). Use of such generic terminology spread after the war.

The latter description is said to have been used by writer Kako Senda (1924_2000) in his book titled "*Jugun Ianfu*" published in 1973.

Thereafter, the usage of *jugun ianfu* prevailed.

In addition to Japanese women, women from the Korean Peninsula and Taiwan, both then under Japanese colonial rule, and China, the Philippines, Indonesia and other countries invaded by the Imperial Japanese Army were recruited as comfort women.

Hata estimates that 40 percent of the wartime comfort women were Japanese, 30 percent Chinese and other nationalities and 20 percent Korean.

The total number of comfort women has yet to be determined exactly.

According to a report compiled by Radhika Coomaraswamy of the U.N. Commission on Human Rights in 1996, there were 200,000 comfort women from the Korean Peninsula alone.

The figure in the report was based on information Coomaraswamy had obtained in North Korea. But this report contained many factual errors, and its quoted sources lacked impartiality.

Foreign Minister Taro Aso rejected the figure of 200,000 as "lacking objective evidence."

The reasons cited for the need for comfort women and wartime brothels are as follows:

- To prevent military officers and soldiers from raping women and committing other sex crimes in occupied areas.

- To prevent venereal disease from spreading through troops who would otherwise contact local prostitutes who did not receive periodic medical checks.

- To prevent military secrets from being leaked by limiting the women who provided sexual services to officers and soldiers to recruited comfort women.

Such a system and the use of wartime brothels generally are not limited only to the Imperial Japanese military.

The U.S. troops that occupied Japan after the war used brothels provided by the Japanese side.

There was a case in which U.S. military officials asked the Japanese authorities to provide women for sexual services.

During the Vietnam War, brothels similar to those established for the former Japanese military were available to U.S. troops, a U.S. woman journalist has pointed out.

Hata said: "There were wartime brothels also for the German troops during World War II.

Some women were forced into sexual slavery. South Korean troops had brothels during the Korean War, according to a finding by a South Korean researcher."

Appendix 3: "BACKGROUND OF 'COMFORT WOMEN' ISSUE / No hard evidence of coercion in recruitment of comfort women" (The Yomiuri Shimbun)

This is the second installment on the so-called "comfort women" controversy. The U.S. House of Representatives has been deliberating a draft resolution calling for the Japanese government to apologize over the matter by spurning the practice as slavery and human trafficking. Why has such a biased view of the issue prevailed_

The issue of the so-called comfort women has been brought up repeatedly because misunderstandings that the Japanese government and the Imperial Japanese Army forced women into sexual servitude have not been completely dispelled.

The government has admitted the Imperial Japanese Army's involvement in brothels, saying that "the then Japanese military was, directly or indirectly, involved in the establishment and management of the comfort stations and the transfer of comfort women." The "involvement" refers to giving the green light to opening a brothel, building facilities, setting regulations regarding brothels, such as fees and opening hours, and conducting inspections by army doctors.

However, the government has denied that the Japanese military forcibly recruited women. On March 18, 1997, a Cabinet Secretariat official said in the Diet, "There is no evidence in public documents that clearly shows there were any forcible actions [in recruiting comfort women]." No further evidence that could disprove this statement has been found.

The belief that comfort women were forcibly recruited started to spread when Seiji Yoshida, who claimed to be a former head of the mobilization department of the Shimonoseki branch of an organization in charge of recruiting laborers, published a book titled "Watashi no Senso Hanzai" (My War Crime) in 1983. Yoshida said in the book that he had been involved in looking for suitable women to force them into sexual slavery in Jeju, South Korea. "We surrounded wailing women, took them by the arms and dragged them out into the street one by one," he said in the book.

But researchers concluded in the mid-1990s that the stories in the book are not authentic. On March 5 this year, Prime Minister Shinzo Abe said at the House of Councillors Budget Committee that Yoshida's story does not prove that women were forcibly recruited. He said: "I think it was The Asahi Shimbun [that reported the story] that a man named Seiji Yoshida testified about his having searched for comfort women. But later [Yoshida's testimony] was found to have been made up."

As the comfort women issue started to take on political and diplomatic dimensions, some people in South Korea and also in Japan confused comfort women with female volunteer corps, strengthening the misbelief that there was coercion.

Female volunteer corps were, according to a historian Ikuhiko Hata's book "Ianfu to Senjo no Sei" (Comfort Women and Sex in the Battlefield), single women aged between 12 and 40 who were mobilized to work in factories, starting in August 1944, primarily to secure necessary labor.

There were cases in which malicious brokers sweet-talked women with promises of easy money or intentionally concealed from them what life was going to be like in brothels.

The War Ministry wrote a letter, dated March 4, 1938, to the troops dispatched to China. The letter, titled "Regarding the recruiting of women at the army's comfort stations," said there were malicious brokers who were recruiting women in a way "similar to kidnapping."

It said, "Nothing should be overlooked so that the military's prestige and social orders are maintained." The letter indicates how the Imperial Japanese Army tried to make sure that women were not forcibly recruited.

However, in the confusion of war, elite Imperial Japanese Army soldiers who were on the fast track for officer status sent detained Dutch women to a brothel in Indonesia. The incident came to be known as the Semarang incident.

The Imperial Japanese Army Headquarters closed down the brothel immediately after learning of the incident, and soldiers involved received severe punishment--some were sentenced to death--at a war crimes court convened by the Dutch Army after the war.

Appendix 4: "BACKGROUND OF 'COMFORT WOMEN' ISSUE / Kono's statement on 'comfort women' created misunderstanding" (The Yomiuri Shimbun)

This is the third and last installment on the so-called "comfort women" controversy. The U.S. House of Representatives has been deliberating a draft resolution calling for the Japanese government to apologize over the matter by spurning the practice as slavery and human trafficking. Why has such a biased view of the issue prevailed?

What made the issue of "comfort women" a political and diplomatic one was an article in the Jan. 11, 1992, morning edition of The Asahi Shimbun. The newspaper reported that official documents and soldiers' diaries that proved the wartime Japanese military's involvement in the management of brothels and the recruitment of comfort women had been found at the library of the Defense Ministry's National Institute for Defense Studies.

The article said Koreans accounted for about 80 percent of comfort women from the time that brothels were established and that the women, said to have totaled 80,000 to 200,000, were forcibly recruited under the name of volunteer corps after the Pacific War broke out.

As the newspaper's report came out immediately before then Prime Minister Kiichi Miyazawa's visit to South Korea, it triggered anger among the South Korean public. During his visit to the nation, Miyazawa met with then South Korean President Roh Tae Woo and was quoted as telling him, "It can't be denied that the Japanese military--in some way--was involved in the recruitment of comfort women and the management of comfort stations."

On July 6, 1992, then Chief Cabinet Secretary Koichi Kato released the results of a study showing that the wartime military was directly involved in such things as the operation of "comfort stations," but documents to prove that forcible recruitment actually took place were not found.

But as South Korea's criticism over Japan's actions continued, the government issued an official statement on the issue on Aug. 4, 1993, which became known as the Kono statement, after the government official who delivered it, Chief Cabinet Secretary Yohei Kono.

But Kono's statement included ambiguous expressions and gave the impression that the government had acknowledged forcible recruitment by wartime Japanese authorities.

Regarding the recruitment of comfort women, the statement said: "The recruitment of the comfort women was conducted mainly by private recruiters who acted in response to the request of the military. The government study has revealed

that in many cases they were recruited against their own will, through coaxing, coercion, and so on, and that, at times, administrative and military personnel directly took part in the recruitment."

The statement also said the recruitment, transfer and control of comfort women on the Korean Peninsula was "conducted generally against their will." This expression became a strong indication that women, in most cases, were taken in a forcible manner.

By issuing the statement, the government aimed to seek a political settlement over the issue, as South Korea pressed the Japanese government hard to recognize that forcible recruitment actually took place. Then Deputy Chief Cabinet Secretary Nobuo Ishihara, who was involved in compiling the statement, said, "As there were no documents to prove forcible recruitment, it was concluded, out of comprehensively made judgments based on testimonies of [former] comfort women, that [recruitment] was forceful."

Kono's statement did not resolve the issue. Instead, it spread misunderstanding both inside and outside the nation on the "forcible recruitment" by government authorities.

A U.N. Human Rights Commission report, compiled by Radhika Coomaraswamy, referred to comfort women as sex slaves, and called on the Japanese government to compensate these women and to punish those responsible. The report reached these conclusions partly on the grounds of Kono's statement.

Mike Honda, a Democratic member of the U.S. House of Representatives who led lawmakers in submitting a draft resolution denouncing Japan over the comfort women issue, also referred to Kono's statement as a basis for the draft resolution.

However, observers have pointed out, and The Yomiuri Shimbun reported on the morning edition of March 16, that there are certain factors regarding Honda's electoral district--such an increase in the number of residents of Chinese or South Korean origins, while the number of Japanese-origin residents has decreased--that may be behind why the Japanese-American lawmaker of California is leading such an initiative.

Given the Kono statement, the government in July 1995 established an incorporated foundation called the Asian Women's Fund. It has provided a total of about 1.3 billion yen in compensation for 364 former comfort women. Letters of apology from successive prime ministers--Ryutaro Hashimoto, Keizo Obuchi, Yoshiro Mori and Junichiro Koizumi--also were sent to those women.

On Oct. 5 at the House of Representatives Budget Committee, Prime Minister Shinzo Abe indicated a stance to "inherit" Kono's statement in principle, while denying forcible recruitment by government authorities.